



# Legal and Ethical Considerations in the Use of DNA Fingerprinting

**Pratibha Tiwari** <sup>a++\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> *Uttar Pradesh Forensic Science Laboratory, Lucknow, UP, UP Police Technical Services, India.*

## **Author's contribution**

*The sole author designed, analyzed, interpreted and prepared the manuscript.*

## **Article Information**

DOI: 10.9734/JSRR/2024/v30i31875

## **Open Peer Review History:**

This journal follows the Advanced Open Peer Review policy. Identity of the Reviewers, Editor(s) and additional Reviewers, peer review comments, different versions of the manuscript, comments of the editors, etc are available here: <https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/112377>

**Review Article**

**Received: 03/12/2023**  
**Accepted: 08/02/2024**  
**Published: 17/02/2024**

## **ABSTRACT**

DNA fingerprinting, a critical tool in modern forensic science, presents complex legal and ethical challenges and examines the intricate balance between leveraging the benefits of DNA technology in criminal justice and protecting individual rights. It includes privacy concerns, the necessity of informed consent, the accuracy and reliability of DNA evidence, and ethical considerations in its application within the criminal justice system and also delves into the management of DNA data, highlighting the need for stringent regulations to prevent misuse and ensure data protection. The importance of comprehensive legal frameworks is discussed to govern the collection, use, and sharing of DNA information, alongside ensuring public trust through transparency and non-discriminatory practices and addresses the need for international standards and cooperation in the context of globalized crime and forensic investigation. It concludes by emphasizing the need for ongoing evaluation and adaptation of legal and ethical guidelines to keep pace with advancements in DNA technology.

**Keywords:** *DNA fingerprinting; legal; genetic information; ethical considerations.*

<sup>++</sup>Forensic Scientist-DNA;

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author: E-mail: [pratibhafsl@gmail.com](mailto:pratibhafsl@gmail.com);

## 1. INTRODUCTION

A primary concern with DNA fingerprinting is the privacy of genetic information. DNA is more than just a tool for identification; it contains sensitive data about an individual's genetic makeup, predisposition to diseases, and other personal attributes. Ensuring the privacy of this data is a paramount ethical issue. This concern extends to the necessity of obtaining informed consent. Individuals should be informed about how their DNA will be used, and stored, and who will have access to it [1-2]. This consent is not just a legal formality but a fundamental right, ensuring respect for personal autonomy and privacy.

### 1.1 Accuracy and Reliability

In legal contexts, particularly in criminal justice, the accuracy and reliability of DNA fingerprinting are of utmost importance. Incorrect or misleading DNA analysis can lead to wrongful convictions or the acquittal of the guilty. Establishing rigorous standards for DNA testing procedures and interpretation of results is essential to uphold the integrity of the legal process. Moreover, the possibility of contamination or tampering with DNA samples necessitates strict protocols to ensure the reliability of the evidence [3].

### 1.2 Application in Criminal Justice

DNA fingerprinting's role in criminal justice is multifaceted. It aids in identifying suspects, exonerating the innocent, and linking different crimes. However, this powerful tool also raises ethical concerns regarding its potential misuse for unwarranted surveillance and profiling. The legal system must ensure that DNA evidence is used fairly and equitably, avoiding any form of discrimination or bias, particularly against marginalized communities [4].

### 1.3 Data Management

Managing DNA data involves addressing ethical and legal challenges related to storage, access, and sharing of this information. There's a critical need for strict regulations to prevent unauthorized access and to protect individuals from potential discrimination, especially in employment or insurance. Questions about the duration of data storage and the right to have one's DNA data deleted are also crucial in respecting individual rights [5].

### 1.4 The Revolutionary Impact of DNA Fingerprinting

The advent of DNA fingerprinting has marked a revolution in forensic science, offering an unparalleled level of precision in identifying individuals. This breakthrough, emerging from the realms of molecular biology and genetics, has transformed the way law enforcement, legal systems, and even historical and anthropological research operate. It's a technique that allows for the detailed profiling of an individual's DNA, a kind of genetic blueprint unique to each person [6].

The introduction of DNA fingerprinting into the justice system has been akin to a paradigm shift. Its power lies in its ability to conclusively link individuals to places, events, or other individuals, making it an invaluable tool in solving crimes, identifying bodies, and even reuniting families. In many cases, DNA evidence has been the linchpin in cracking cases that had remained unsolved for years, providing closure to countless victims and their families [7].

However, like any powerful tool, DNA fingerprinting doesn't come without its challenges. Its very power and effectiveness necessitate a cautious approach. The ethical and legal landscapes surrounding the use of DNA evidence are complex and constantly evolving. Privacy concerns, issues of consent, and the potential for misuse are just a few of the critical considerations that need to be carefully navigated [8].

### 1.5 Balancing Science and Rights

This balance between harnessing the scientific power of DNA fingerprinting and respecting individual rights and freedoms poses a significant challenge. Legal systems worldwide are grappling with how to integrate this technology in a way that maximizes its potential for public good while safeguarding against violations of privacy and civil liberties [9].

### 1.6 The Global Implications

Furthermore, in an increasingly interconnected world, the implications of DNA fingerprinting extend beyond national borders. International cooperation, standardization of procedures, and cross-border ethical considerations add layers of complexity to this issue [10].

## **2. THE NEED FOR ONGOING DIALOGUE**

As we continue to explore the capabilities of DNA fingerprinting, the need for ongoing dialogue among scientists, legal experts, ethicists, and the public becomes increasingly important. This conversation is crucial for ensuring that as we advance in our scientific capabilities, we do so with a keen awareness of the legal and ethical responsibilities that accompany these advancements [11].

### **2.1 Setting the Stage for Discussion**

The deep into the multifaceted legal and ethical considerations surrounding DNA fingerprinting. This exploration is not just about understanding the technology's mechanics or its efficacy in various fields but about comprehending the broader implications of its use. The challenges and opportunities presented by DNA fingerprinting span a wide spectrum, from enhancing forensic investigations to grappling with complex privacy issues and ethical dilemmas [12].

### **2.2 Understanding the Complexities of DNA Evidence**

DNA fingerprinting, while scientifically robust, brings to the fore questions about the nature of evidence and its interpretation in legal contexts. The way DNA evidence is collected, analyzed, and presented in courtrooms has profound implications for justice and civil liberties. It demands a nuanced understanding of both its scientific potential and its limitations [13].

### **2.3 Ethical Implications in a Modern Context**

The ethical implications of DNA fingerprinting extend beyond the individual to society at large. How do we balance the collective benefits of solving crimes and identifying individuals with the need to protect individual privacy and prevent genetic discrimination? The answers to these questions are not straightforward and require a careful examination of ethical principles, societal values, and legal precedents [14].

### **2.4 The Legal Frameworks and Privacy Concerns**

One of the pivotal aspects we will explore is the legal framework governing the use of DNA

fingerprinting. This includes laws and regulations that address consent for DNA collection, data protection, access to genetic information, and the handling of DNA databases. Privacy concerns are at the heart of these legal debates, raising questions about ownership of genetic information and the right to privacy in an age where personal data can be easily and indefinitely stored.

### **2.5 International Perspectives and Standards**

Given the global nature of crime, terrorism, and migration, DNA fingerprinting also has significant international dimensions. We will examine how different countries approach the use of DNA evidence, the standards set for its application, and the international collaboration necessary for cross-border issues. This global perspective is essential for understanding how DNA fingerprinting fits into the larger puzzle of international law and human rights.

### **2.6 Towards a Responsible Use of DNA Technology**

Ultimately, this article aims to contribute to the ongoing dialogue about the responsible use of DNA fingerprinting. By analyzing the legal and ethical aspects, we can better equip ourselves to use this technology in a way that upholds justice, and truth, and respects individual rights. It's about finding the delicate balance between the promise of DNA fingerprinting and the protection of fundamental ethical and legal principles that govern our society.

## **3. REGULATORY FRAMEWORKS**

A comprehensive legal framework governing the use of DNA fingerprinting is essential. This framework should address various aspects, including the collection, use, and sharing of DNA data, along with establishing penalties for misuse. It should balance the benefits of DNA technology in solving crimes and protecting public safety with the need to safeguard individual rights and privacy [15].

## **4. PUBLIC TRUST AND TRANSPARENCY**

For the ethical use of DNA fingerprinting, maintaining public trust is crucial. This involves transparency in the methods and purposes for which DNA data is used. Ensuring that its

application is fair, unbiased, and respectful of human rights is critical for maintaining public confidence in the justice system [16].

## 5. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

Given the cross-border nature of crimes and investigations, international cooperation and standards in DNA data handling are vital. These standards should respect the diverse legal, ethical, and cultural norms of different countries and ensure that international human rights are upheld in the process of DNA data exchange. DNA fingerprinting, a powerful forensic tool, poses significant legal and ethical challenges. Balancing the utility of DNA technology in forensic science with the protection of individual rights and privacy is crucial. As technology advances, legal and ethical frameworks must evolve accordingly to address new challenges and ensure the responsible use of DNA fingerprinting [18].

## 6. PRIVACY AND CONSENT

One of the primary concerns surrounding DNA fingerprinting is privacy. Every individual's DNA is unique and contains sensitive information about their genetic makeup. The ethical dilemma arises in protecting this personal data from misuse. Informed consent is a cornerstone principle here, ensuring that individuals are fully aware of how their DNA will be used, and stored, and who will have access to it [20-25].

## 7. ACCURACY AND RELIABILITY

The legal implications of DNA fingerprinting are profound, especially in criminal justice. The accuracy and reliability of DNA evidence are paramount, as errors can lead to wrongful convictions or the acquittal of the guilty. Establishing stringent standards for DNA testing and interpretation is crucial to maintain its integrity in legal proceedings [26-29].

## 8. APPLICATION IN CRIMINAL JUSTICE

While DNA fingerprinting is a powerful tool for solving crimes, it raises ethical questions about potential misuse for surveillance and profiling. There's also the concern of disproportionately targeting marginalized communities. Legal frameworks must ensure fair and equitable use of DNA evidence in criminal investigations. A comprehensive legal framework is essential for

governing the use of DNA fingerprinting. This includes laws on data collection, usage, sharing, and penalties for misuse, ensuring a balance between societal benefits and individual rights. Maintaining public trust is critical. Transparency in the application of DNA fingerprinting, alongside guarantees of fair and non-discriminatory use, is essential for ethical practice [17].

## 9. INTERNATIONAL STANDARDS

Given the global nature of crime and investigation, international cooperation and standards in DNA data handling are necessary. These should respect the diverse legal and cultural norms across countries [19].

## 10. CONCLUSION

DNA fingerprinting, while a formidable tool in forensic science, presents significant legal and ethical challenges. Striking a balance between the benefits of DNA technology and the protection of individual rights is paramount. As technology advances, continuous evaluation and adaptation of legal and ethical frameworks are essential to address emerging concerns.

In conclusion, DNA fingerprinting stands as a double-edged sword: a powerful tool for justice and truth, yet one that raises significant legal and ethical challenges. This technology, with its remarkable ability to identify individuals with high precision, has transformed forensic science and had profound implications for criminal justice systems worldwide. However, as we have discussed, its use must be tempered with a deep understanding and respect for privacy, consent, and the potential for misuse. The legal frameworks surrounding DNA fingerprinting are evolving, striving to keep pace with technological advancements. It's essential that these frameworks are robust, ensuring that DNA evidence is collected, stored, and used in a manner that upholds the principles of justice and respects individual rights. The issues of data privacy, consent for DNA collection, and the rights to one's genetic information are paramount in these discussions.

Ethically, the deployment of DNA fingerprinting technology must be guided by a commitment to fairness, non-discrimination, and transparency.

The potential for misuse in surveillance, profiling, and the disproportionate impact on marginalized communities calls for a vigilant and ongoing assessment of how this technology is applied [30-34].

Internationally, the cross-border nature of crime and the global movement of populations necessitate international standards and cooperation in the use of DNA data. This approach should respect the diverse legal, ethical, and cultural norms of different countries while upholding universal human rights standards [35-36].

The future of DNA fingerprinting depends on our ability to balance its benefits in enhancing forensic science and solving crimes with the need to protect individual freedoms and prevent the erosion of privacy. As we continue to explore and expand the capabilities of this technology, we must engage in continuous dialogue among scientists, legal experts, ethicists, and the public. This dialogue is crucial for ensuring that we advance scientifically while remaining steadfast in our commitment to ethical and legal principles. Thus, DNA fingerprinting, as a testament to human ingenuity, also serves as a reminder of our responsibility to wield such power wisely and ethically, always with an eye towards the protection of individual rights and the pursuit of justice [37-39].

## COMPETING INTERESTS

Author has declared that no competing interests exist.

## REFERENCES

1. Melson KE. Legal and ethical considerations. In DNA Fingerprinting: An Introduction London: Palgrave Macmillan UK. 1990;189-215.
2. Van Camp N, Dierckx K. The expansion of forensic DNA databases and police sampling powers in the post-9/11 era: ethical considerations on genetic privacy. *Ethical Perspectives*. 2007;14(3):237-268.
3. Cho MK, Sankar P. Forensic genetics and ethical, legal and social implications beyond the clinic. *Nature Genetics*. 2004;36(Suppl 11):S8-S12.
4. Jayanitha S, Kartheeswaran T. Ethical, legal and social issues in bioinformatics applications; 2019.
5. Wienroth M, Morling N, Williams R. Technological innovations in forensic genetics: social, legal and ethical aspects. *Recent Advances in DNA & Gene Sequences (Formerly Recent Patents on DNA & Gene Sequences)*. 2014;8(2):98-103.
6. Beyleveld D. Ethical issues in the forensic applications of DNA analysis. *Forensic Science International*. 1997;88(1):3-15.
7. Levitt, Mairi. Forensic databases: Benefits and ethical and social costs. *British Medical Bulletin*. 2007;83(1): 235-248.
8. Primorac D, Schanfield M. (Eds.). *Forensic DNA applications: An interdisciplinary perspective*. CRC Press; 2023.
9. Rothstein MA, Talbott MK. The expanding use of DNA in law enforcement: what role for privacy?. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*. 2006;34(2):153-164.
10. Williams R, Johnson P. Inclusiveness, effectiveness and intrusiveness: issues in the developing uses of DNA profiling in support of criminal investigations. *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, 2005;33(3), 545-558.
11. Ewalt J, Jillson KC, Laguerre S. *Dna fingerprinting*. Dna; 2007.
12. Bhargava, Pushpa M. Social and related implications of DNA fingerprinting and other new DNA technologies. *Electrophoresis*. 1995;16(1):1775-1781.
13. Weiss MG. Strange DNA: The rise of DNA analysis for family reunification and its ethical implications. *Genomics, Society and Policy*. 2011;7:1-20.
14. McEwen, Jean E. *State DNA forensic databanking: Legal, ethical, and social policy implications and recommendations for the future*. Brandeis University, The Heller School for Social Policy and Management; 1996.
15. Lazer D. (Ed.). *DNA and the criminal justice system: The technology of justice*. MIT Press; 2004.
16. Machado H, Silva S. *Informed consent in forensic DNA databases: Volunteering, constructions of risk and identity*

- categorization. *Biosocieties*. 2009;4(4):335-348.
17. Palmour N. Forensic applications of molecular genetics: Ethics and Law to Inform Policy Issues; 2009.
  18. Ghosh D, Ekta Ghosh D. Intensive training in breast imaging with artificial intelligence and deep learning-a review article. In *Acta Biology Forum*. 2022;18-26.
  19. Weiss MJ. Beware! Uncle Sam has your DNA: Legal fallout from its use and misuse in the US. *Ethics and Information Technology*. 2004;6:55-63.
  20. Heinemann T, Lemke T, Prainsack B. Risky profiles: Societal dimensions of forensic uses of DNA profiling technologies. *New Genetics and Society*. 2012;31(3):249-258.
  21. Lee H. The Commercialization of crime solving: Ethical Implication of Forensic Genetic Genealogy; 2021
  22. Mooki O. DNA typing as a forensic tool: Applications and implications for civil liberties. *South African Journal on Human Rights*. 1997;13(4):565-580.
  23. Williams R, Johnson P. Forensic DNA databasing: A European perspective. The Wellcome Trust, Interim Report. 2005;16.
  24. Sikkander AM. Intrathecal Chemotherapy for Blood Cancer Treatment. In *Acta Biology Forum*. 2022;14-17.
  25. Machado H, Neiva L, Granja R, Silva S. Ethical, legal, and social challenges of next-generation sequencing technologies (NGS) in forensic criminal identification. In *Next Generation Sequencing (NGS) Technology in DNA Analysis* Academic Press. 2024;551-569.
  26. Butler JM. Forensic DNA typing: biology, technology, and genetics of STR markers. Elsevier; 2005
  27. Williams R, Wienroth M. Ethical, social and policy aspects of forensic genetics: A Systematic Review; 2014
  28. Ashokri HAA, Abuzirriq MAK. The impact of environmental awareness on personal carbon footprint values of biology department students, Faculty of Science, El-Mergib University, Al-Khums, Libya. In *Acta Biology Forum*. 2023;V02i02: 18:22).
  29. Bhattacharjee, Gargi, Khushal Khambhati, Nisarg Gohil, Happy Panchasara, Shreya Patel, and Vijai Singh. Exploiting the potential of DNA fingerprinting in forensic science. Introduction of forensic nanotechnology as future armour. Nova Publishers Inc. New York. 2019:145-185.
  30. Krysztofiak B. DNA profiling of unidentified human remains in the South African context: An ethico-legal analysis. University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa; 2016.
  31. Kaye DH, Smith ME. DNA identification databases: legality, legitimacy, and the case for population-wide coverage. *Wis. L. Rev*. 2003;413.
  32. McEwen J, Pino N, Raphael A, Renna K., Boyer J, Brody LC. Investigative genetic genealogy: Ethical, legal, and social issues and directions for future research. *Forensic Genomics*. 2021;1(3): 91-98.
  33. Ghosh D, Ekta Ghosh D. A Large-Scale Multi-Centre Research On Domain Generalisation in Deep Learning-Based Mass Detection in Mammography: A Review. In *Acta Biology Forum* . 2022;5-9.
  34. Cox, Margaret, and Peter Jones. "Ethical considerations in the use of DNA as a contribution toward the determination of identification in historic cases: considerations from the Western front. *New Genetics and Society*. 2014: 33(3):295-312.
  35. Scudder N, McNevin D, Kelty SF, Walsh S. J, Robertson J. Massively parallel sequencing and the emergence of forensic genomics: Defining the policy and legal issues for law enforcement. *Science & Justice*. 2018;58(2):153-158.
  36. Godard B, Schmidtke J, Cassiman JJ, Aymé S. Data storage and DNA banking for biomedical research: informed consent, confidentiality, quality issues, ownership, return of benefits. A professional perspective. *European Journal of Human Genetics*. 2003;11(2):S88-S122.
  37. Templeton JE, Taylor D, Handt O, Linacre A. Typing DNA profiles from previously enhanced fingerprints using direct PCR. *Forensic Science International: Genetics*. 2017;29:276-282.

38. Machado H, Silva S. Public participation in genetic databases: crossing the boundaries between biobanks and forensic DNA databases through the principle of solidarity. *Journal of Medical Ethics*; 2015.
39. Katsanis SH. Pedigrees and perpetrators: uses of DNA and genealogy in forensic investigations. *Annual Review of Genomics and Human Genetics*. 2020; 21:535-564.

© 2024 Tiwari; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

*Peer-review history:*

*The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:*  
<https://www.sdiarticle5.com/review-history/112377>